



INTERNATIONAL TELECOMMUNICATION UNION

**TELECOMMUNICATION
STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**

STUDY PERIOD 2017-2020

SG13-TD240-R1/WP2

STUDY GROUP 13

Original: English

Question(s): 19/13

Geneva, 18 April 2018

TD

Source: Rapporteurs

Title: Report of Q19/13, (Geneva 9-18 April 2018)

Purpose: Information

Contact: Emil Kowalczyk
Orange Polska S.A.
Poland

Tel: +48 502 397 809
E-mail: Emil.Kowalczyk@orange.com

Contact: Ying Cheng
China Unicom
P.R.China

Tel: +86-10-66259394
Fax: +86-10-66259154
Email: chengying10@chinaunicom.cn

Keywords: Q19/13, report,

Abstract: Report of Q19/13 meeting hold 9 – 18 April 2018, Geneva.

1 Opening of the meeting

Rapporteur of Question 19/13, Mr Emil Kowalczyk (Orange Polska) welcomed participants and provided agenda for meeting. The agenda were accepted and approved by Delegates. .

2 Previous meeting

The report from the previous Q19/13 meeting hold at Geneva, 9-18 April 2018 ([TD 183 \(WP2/13\)](#)) were evoked.

3 Goals of this meeting

The Rapporteur indicated goals of this meeting as follows:

- Progress on-going draft Recommendation :
 - o Y.CCICDM-Req,
 - o Y.CCICTM,
 - o Y.BDDP-reqts
 - o Y.cslm-metadata
 - o Y.CCM-req
- Discuss new work items introduced by contributions
- Review the Q19/13 Roadmap and Q19/13 Living Lists
- Review the Q19/13 Work Programme
- Participate in joint sessions with other Questions as needed

4 Approval of the agenda

The agenda (posted as [TD-0226-WP2](#) was presented and approved by the meeting.

5 Discussion of input documents (including liaisons)

5.1 Documents for All questions

The following documents were reviewed and noted.

Document	Subject	Source	Questions	Preliminary decision
GENERAL				
[219-GEN]	Draft of guidelines and methodologies for developing technical Recommendations, output of the 5th meeting of the SG13 ad hoc group on "Guidelines for development of technical Recommendations" held during the e-meeting, 26 January 2018	Co-editors of the SG13 ad hoc group	ALL/13	This document provides newest draft of guidelines and methodologies for developing technical Recommendations, with focusing on unification terminology related to requirements.
[218-GEN]	Report of the fifth meeting of the SG13 ad hoc group on "Guidelines for development of technical Recommendations", e-meeting, Friday 26 January 2018, 9:00-10:30 Geneva time	Co-Convenors of the SG13 ad hoc group	ALL/13	In line of TD-218-GEN.
[212-GEN]	LS/i on OTNT Standardization Work Plan [from ITU-T SG15]	ITU-T SG15	ALL/13	Noted as Optical Transport Networks Technology Standardization Work Plan is out of scope Q19/13.
[211-GEN]	LS/i on the new version of the Home Network Transport (HNT) Standards Overview and Work Plan [from ITU-T SG15]	ITU-T SG15	ALL/13	Noted as Home Network Transport Standards Overview and Work Plan is out of scope Q19/13.
[210-GEN]	LS/i on the new version of the Access Network Transport (ANT) Standards Overview and Work Plan [from ITU-T SG15]	ITU-T SG15	ALL/13	Noted as Access Network Transport (ANT) Standards Overview and Work Plan is out of scope Q19/13.

[209-GEN]	LS/i on Definition of broadband access [from SCV]	Standardization Committee for Vocabulary	ALL/13	Noted.
[208-GEN]	LS/i on the terms and definitions database [from ITU-T SG9]	ITU-T SG9	ALL/13	Noted.
[207-GEN]	LS/i on Formation of a new ETSI ISG for Zero Touch Network and Service Management (ZSM) F [from ETSI ISG ZSM]	ETSI ISG ZSM	ALL/13	This initiative could be potentially in line of Q19/13 activities in terms of ZTN and service management.
[204-GEN]	LS/i/r on establishment of new Focus Group on Machine Learning for Future Networks including 5G (reply to SG13-LS38) [from ITU-T SG2]	ITU-T SG2	ALL/13	This initiative could be potentially in line of Q19/13 activities in terms of software infrastructure and supporting cloud computing management by technologies based on ML/AL.
[203-GEN]	LS/i on ITU-T Recommendations relevant information for users [from ITU-T SG5]	ITU-T SG5	ALL/13	Noted.
[202-GEN]	LS/i on Enhancing ITU-T document templates [from ITU-T SG5]	ITU-T SG5	ALL/13	Noted.
[199-GEN]	LS/i/r on request for background information on the implementation of the 2012 International Telecommunication Regulations - additional information (reply to TSAG-LS008) [from TSAG]	TSAG	ALL/13	Noted.
[198-GEN]	LS/i on updated reference table of ITU-T Recommendations to be used for conformity and interoperability testing [from ITU-T SG 11]	ITU-T SG11	ALL/13	Noted.
[217-GEN]	LS/i on new work item X.sgBDIP "Security Guidelines for Big Data infrastructure and platform" [from ITU-T SG17]	ITU-T SG17	Q7/13, Q6/13, Q2/13, Q19/13,	This inform about Security for Big Data activities around ITU-T SG17.

			Q18/13, Q17/13	
[216-GEN]	LS/i to ITU-T SG 13 (Text for publication as Technical Specification) [from ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 27]	ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 27	Q7/13, Q22/13, Q19/13, Q18/13, Q17/13	Noted. Potentially interested for Q19/ activities towards Identity proofing.
[205-GEN]	LS/i on Telecommunication Management and OAM Project Plan [from ITU-T SG2]	ITU-T SG2	Q23/13, Q22/13, Q2/13, Q19/13, Q18/13, Q17/13	Noted.
[388-GEN]	Predictive fault and performance management to ensure carrier grade reliability and availability of virtual network services on multiple clouds	Department of Telecommunications and Postal Services , Ministry of Communications	Q19/13	Moved to SG13 RGM#2 contributions area (RGM Contribution 86)

5.2 Incoming liaisons, others for Cloud for Q19/13

The following documents were reviewed and noted.

Document	Subject	Source	Questions	Preliminary decision
WP2				
[198-WP2]	LS/i on New ITU-T SG13 terms and definitions [from SCV]	Standardization Committee for Vocabulary (SCV)	Q19/13	Noted, definition proposed after ITU-T Y.3514 are accepted. DB is updated accordingly.
[196-WP2]	LS/i on consent of M.3071 (ex. M.cbnmsa): Cloud-based network management functional architecture [from ITU-T SG2]	ITU-T SG2	Q19/13, Q18/13, Q17/13	The cloud-based network management FA is proposed
[195-WP2]	LS/i/r on invitation to review Cloud Computing Standardization Roadmap and provide missing or update information (reply to SG13-LS43) [from ITU-T SG2]	ITU-T SG2	Q19/13, Q17/13	The updated roadmap is provided with focusing on draft Rec. M.cbnmsa ("Cloud-based network management functional

				architecture”) and M.rmmctm (“Requirements for resource management in cloud-aware telecommunication management system”).
[194-WP2]	LS/i/r on work item on "Cloud computing - Requirements for inter-cloud data management" (Y.CCICDM-Req) and JRG-CCM issue (reply to SG13-LS33) [from ITU-T SG2]	ITU-T SG2	Q19/13, Q18/13, Q17/13	The SG2 question 5 is providing draft Rec. TU-T M.rdm, “Requirements for Data Management in the TMN” and invite WP2/13 to future collaboration on it.
[192-WP2]	LS/i/r on progress of ITU-T Y.3516 (ex Y.CCIC-arch) "Cloud computing - Functional architecture of inter-cloud computing" (reply to SG13-LS28) [from ITU-T SG11]	ITU-T SG11	Q19/13, Q18/13, Q17/13	The SG11 inform about consent of Q.infra-iop (“Cloud computing infrastructure capabilities interoperability testing – part 1: Interoperability testing between CSC and CSP”) and invite for future collaboration.

5.3 Y.CCICDM-Req

Base document: [\[TD 174-WP2/13 \]](#)

Number	Title	Source	Qs	Disposition
[C-101]	Proposal for addition of Clause 6 and Clause 7 in Y.CCICDM-Req Accepted.	China Unicom	Q19/13	Accepted.

5.4 Y.BDDP-reqts

Base document: [\[TD 176-WP2/13 \]](#)

Number	Title	Source	Qs	Disposition
[C-102]	Proposal for modification of 6.1 in Y.BDDP-reqts	China Unicom	Q19/13	Accepted with modifications.
[C-13]	Proposed adding a new use case for Y.BDDP-reqts	DaTang Telecommunication Technology	Q19/13	Accepted with modifications.

		& Industry Holding Co. Ltd		
[C-12]	Proposed modification for clause 6.2 of Y.BDDP-reqts	DaTang Telecommunication Technology & Industry Holding Co. Ltd	Q19/13	Accepted with modifications.

5.5 Y.CCICTM

Base document: [\[TD 175-WP2/13 \]](#)

Number	Title	Source	Qs	Disposition
[C-14]	Proposed adding a new clause 6.3 and bibliography for Y.CCICTM	DaTang Telecommunication Technology & Industry Holding Co. Ltd	Q19/13	Accepted.

5.6 Y.cslm-metadata

Base document: [\[TD 177-WP2/13 \]](#)

Number	Title	Source	Qs	Disposition
[C-15]	Proposed modification for clause 8.1 of Y.cslm-metadata	DaTang Telecommunication Technology & Industry Holding Co. Ltd	Q19/13	Accepted with modifications.

5.7 New Work Item Proposals

Number	Title	Source	Qs	Disposition
[C-86]	Proposal of new work item on “Predictive Fault and performance management to ensure carrier grade reliability and availability of virtual network services on multiple clouds”	India	Q19/13	During discussion, meeting pointed out unclear title as well as lack of proper form needed for new work item (skeleton, scope of work, use case). Some improvement were done in time of drafting session, however finally meeting decided to move this material for living list to provide more

				time for clarification scope of work and main focus of this new work item.
--	--	--	--	----------------------------------------------------------------------------

6 Review the Work Program

The work program of Q19/13 was reviewed and updated. In particular, targets for Consent for all on-going draft Recs. were widely discussed are modified based on current state of these documents. The current work program for Q19/13 can be found in Annex A.

7 Roadmap for Q19/13

The roadmap of Q19/13 was reviewed without any modification. The current roadmap for Q19/13 can be found in [[TD 180-WP2/13](#)]

8 Review Living Lists

The living list for Q19/13 was reviewed and updated based on disposition for contributions. In particular, material of “Living list #2: Framework of big data preservation” were removed due to acceptance contribution [[C-102](#)], material of “Living list #3: Cloud service evaluation index” were removed due to acceptance contribution [[C-14](#)]. According to disposition for new work item proposal after [[C-86](#)], the living list was enriched by updated text of contribution. The current Living List for Q19/13 can be found in [TD-WP2-0239](#)

9 Contributions for other Questions

None identified.

10 Drafting

10.1 Draft Rec. Y.CCICDM-req

The draft Rec. was updated by material improved clause 6.1 by providing relationship with cloud computing reference architecture and material improved clause 7 by indication inter-cloud data categorization. As time for Consent of this draft Rec. is coming for 4Q2018, the meeting invited contributions for improving editorial issues, harmonisation between use cases as well as new use cases which will provide new requirements. In time of July’18 meeting there is a plan for full reading this draft Rec. and decide about interim e-meeting if necessary, to deliver mature material on Consent time.

10.2 Draft Rec. Y.CCICTM

This draft Rec. was updated by providing new clause “6.3 Cloud service evaluation framework” and bibliography. This addressed pending issue related to harmonization with ISO/IEC 19086 as indicated in time of former meetings. In consequences, some material located on living list was removed. After investigation maturity of this draft Rec., meeting identified lack of material for clause 7, 8 and 9 with baseline could be found on living list. However, contribution proposed relevant use case are invited.

10.3 Draft Rec. Y.BDDP-reqts

This draft Rec. was updated by providing modification in clause 6.1, which address concept of data preservation, providing new use case about accessing preserved data and providing restructuration of clause 6.3, which pointed out challenges for big data preservation. After investigation maturity of this draft Rec., meeting proposed to invite experts from Question 17/13 for harmonization with big data concept developed under Question 17/13. Additionally, it is needed to expose derived requirements from Appendix to body text.

10.4 Draft Rec. Y.cslm-metadata

This draft Rec. was update by material describing metadata framework in NaaS Service lifecycle management and relevant figure illustrate this framework. After review, identified that this draft Rec., is strong NaaS oriented instead of XaaS as scope stated. Therefore, in time of next meeting, the decision of future direction this draft Rec. have to be taken.

10.5 Draft Rec. Y.CCM-req

This draft Rec. was no evoked by contributions. The Rapporteur pointed out this situation as first time. According to Question 19/13 internal roles, the draft Recs, which is not evoked during 3 following meeting, will be cancel.

11 IPR statement

No IPR statement was received during the meeting.

12 Review and approval of meeting outputs

The Q19/13 meeting approved the following output temporary documents (TDs):

TD-WP2-0235	Output draft Rec. "Cloud computing - Requirements for inter-cloud data management" (Y.CCICDM-Req)
TD-WP2-0236	Output draft Rec. "Cloud computing - Overview of inter-cloud trust management" (Y.CCICTM)
TD-WP2-0237	Output draft Rec. "Big data – Overview and requirements for data preservation " (Y.BDDP-reqts)
TD-WP2-0238	Output draft Rec. "Metadata framework for cloud service lifecycle management " (Y.cslm-metadata)
TD-WP2-0239	Living list for Q19/13

13 Approval of Outgoing Liaisons, if any

The Q19/13 meeting identified lack of Outgoing Liaisons.

14 Future Plan/Meetings

The Q19/13 will meet during the next SG13 Plenary meeting, **16 – 27 July 2018, Geneva**. Main objectives for this meeting include:

- Progress on Q19/13 work items:
 - o draft Rec. "Cloud Computing - Overview of Inter-Cloud Trust Management"
 - o draft Rec. "Cloud Computing - Requirements for Inter-Cloud Data Management"
 - o draft Rec. "Big data – Overview and requirements for data preservation"

- draft Rec. “Metadata framework for cloud service lifecycle management”
- draft Rec. “Cloud computing maturity requirements and framework”
- Discuss any new work items proposals

The follows Question 19/13 meetings are planned in time of SG13 Rapporteur groups, 22 October - 2 November 2018 and SG13 Plenary meeting, 4-15 March 2019.

15 Other Business/Miscellaneous

In time of former meeting, the Question 19/13 were invited by IEEE Communications Standards Magazine to provide current state on cloud computing management activities. After internal discussion, Question 19/13 proposed for IEEE to extend scope of article by other cloud computing activities realised among WP2/13 questions. In consequences, the IEEE published summary and review of cloud computing standards activities, with introduction of Chairman SG13, Dr Leo Lehmann and Dr Kangchan Lee (ETRI), Rapporteur of Q17/13, Dong Wang (ZTE Corporation), Rapporteur of Q18/13 and Dr Emil Kowalczyk (Orange Polska), Rapporteur of Q19/13 as Co-Authors. The text of article is available under IEEE’s link as follows:

<https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/stamp/stamp.jsp?tp=&arnumber=8258593>

16 Review and approval of the meeting report

The Q19/13 reviewed and approved this meeting report.

17 Closing of the meeting

Rapporteur Q19/13, Dr. Emil Kowalczyk showed his thanks and appreciations for all the participants who had devoted so much on the work of Q19/13 and expressed his wishes to meet again during SG13 Plenary Meeting in 16 – 27 July 2018.

Annex A – Q19/13 Work Program

Rec.	Q	Short Title	Status	Approval process	Priority	Target for Consent / Determination / Approval	Revised / New Text Location	Editors	Liaisons
Y.ccictm	19/13	Cloud Computing - Overview of Inter-Cloud Trust Management	N	AAP	H	Q4 2018		Yan Lei Datang Software	
Y.ccicdm-req	19/13	Cloud Computing - Requirements for Inter-Cloud Data Management	N	AAP	H	Q4 2018		Ying Cheng, China Unicom	
Y.BDDP-reqts	19/13	Big data – Overview and requirements for data preservation	N	AAP	H	Q1 2019		Yan Lei Datang Software, Ying Cheng, China Unicom	
Y.cslm-metadata	19/13	Metadata framework for cloud service lifecycle management	N	AAP	M	Q1 2019		Ying Cheng, China Unicom, Yan Lei Datang Software	
Y.ccm-reqts	19/13	Cloud computing maturity requirements and framework	N	AAP	M	Q4 2019		Tingting Zhang, China Mobile, Zhiqiang Hou, China Mobile, Ying Cheng, China Unicom,	

Legend: H – high; M – medium; L – low; N - new; R - revised, D – deleted